

SMOKING

AND

TOBACCO

CONTROL

MONOGRAPH



Those Who Continue To Smoke

*Is Achieving Abstinence
Harder and Do We Need to
Change Our Interventions?*

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF
HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES
National Institutes of Health
National Cancer Institute

Smoking and Tobacco Control Monographs Issued to Date

Strategies to Control Tobacco Use in the United States: A Blueprint for Public Health Action in the 1990's. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 1. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 92-3316, December 1991.

Smokeless Tobacco or Health: An International Perspective. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 2. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 92-3461, September 1992.

Major Local Tobacco Control Ordinances in the United States. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 3. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 93-3532, May 1993.

Respiratory Health Effects of Passive Smoking: Lung Cancer and Other Disorders. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 4. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 93-3605, August 1993.

Tobacco and the Clinician: Interventions for Medical and Dental Practice. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 5. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 94-3693, January 1994.

Community-Based Interventions for Smokers: The COMMIT Field Experience. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 6. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 95-4028, August 1995.

The FTC Cigarette Test Method for Determining Tar, Nicotine, and Carbon Monoxide Yields of U.S. Cigarettes. Report of the NCI Expert Committee. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 7. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 96-4028, August 1996.

Changes in Cigarette Related Disease Risks and Their Implication for Prevention and Control. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 8. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 97-4213, February 1997.

Cigars, Health Effects and Trends. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 9. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 98-4302, February 1998.

Health Effects of Exposure to Environmental Tobacco Smoke. The Report of the California Environmental Protection Agency. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 10. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 99-4645, August 1999.

State and Local Legislative Action to Reduce Tobacco Use. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 11. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 00-4804, August 2000.

Population Based Smoking Cessation: Proceedings of a Conference on What Works to Influence Cessation in the General Population. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 12. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 00-4892, November 2000.

Risks Associated with Smoking Cigarettes with Low Machine-Measured Yields of Tar and Nicotine. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 13. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 02-5047, October 2001.

Changing Adolescent Smoking Prevalence: Where It Is and Why. Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 14. Bethesda, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, National Institutes of Health, National Cancer Institute, NIH Publication No. 02-5086, November 2001.

Preface

The End of An Era

Monograph 15, entitled *Those Who Continue to Smoke: Is Achieving Abstinence Harder and Do We Need to Change Our Interventions?*, marks the end of an era. It is the last of the original series of *Smoking and Tobacco Control Monographs* begun in 1991 under the editorial direction of **Donald R. Shopland**, former coordinator for the Smoking and Tobacco Control Program (STCP) at the National Cancer Institute. From the very inception of the monograph series, the National Cancer Institute has been extremely fortunate to have had **David M. Burns**, M.D., professor of family and preventive medicine at the University of California at San Diego, serve as senior scientific editor.

The National Cancer Institute honors the significant contributions of both these men. Mr. Shopland and Dr. Burns have brought keen insight, knowledge, creativity, and boundless energy and dedication to the production of the monographs. Much of the success of this first series of *Smoking and Tobacco Control Monographs* can be attributed to the vision and commitment of these two leaders in the tobacco control community. Their efforts, and those of the hundreds of other contributors to the first 15 volumes, have laid a solid groundwork for future series.

The National Cancer Institute remains strongly committed to producing and disseminating state-of-the-science smoking and tobacco control monographs. The new series will draw from the strengths of the first series and add several new processes and features to improve the breadth, depth, and policy relevance of the evidence reviewed. One major goal will be to provide the most objective and thorough syntheses of research to inform the ongoing efforts of the National Cancer Institute and the extramural research and tobacco control communities.

Stephen E. Marcus, Ph.D.
Series Editor, Smoking and Tobacco Control Monographs
Tobacco Control Research Branch
Behavioral Research Program
Division of Cancer Control and Population Sciences
National Cancer Institute
National Institutes of Health

Acknowledgements

Monograph 15 is the result of a set of analyses commissioned and funded jointly by the National Cancer Institute and the Tobacco Control Section of the California Department of Health Services. **William Ruppert**, M.S., health program specialist, Tobacco Control Section, California Department of Health Services, Sacramento, CA, was the project officer for the contract.

The *Introduction* was written by **C. Tracy Orleans**, Ph.D., senior scientist and senior program officer at the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, based on her comments at a symposium sponsored by the National Cancer Institute at the Society for Research on Nicotine and Tobacco (SRNT) Eighth Annual Meeting held on February 20, 2002, in Savannah, GA. At this symposium, entitled *Hardening the Target: Are Smokers Less Likely to Quit Now Than in the Past?*, authors of several chapters of Monograph 15 participated in a discussion of the scientific evidence, and Dr. Orleans served as the discussant. Chapter 2 is based on data available as of February 2002.

The managing editor of Monograph 15 is **Richard H. Amacher**, project director, KBM Group Inc., Silver Spring, MD. **Stephen E. Marcus**, Ph.D., completed the editorial direction of the monograph after Mr. Shopland retired and served as its managing editor after the KBM contract ended.

The editors gratefully acknowledge the many researchers and authors who made this monograph possible through their numerous hours of writing and review. Contributors to each chapter are as follows:

Introduction

C. Tracy Orleans, Ph.D.
Robert Wood Johnson
Foundation

Chapter 1 Smokers Who Have Not Quit: Is Cessation More Difficult and Should We Change Our Strategies?

David M. Burns, M.D.
University of California,
San Diego School of
Medicine
San Diego, CA

Kenneth E. Warner, Ph.D.
School of Public Health
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, MI

Chapter 2	The Case for Hardening of the Target	John R. Hughes, M.D. Departments of Psychiatry, Psychology and Family Practice University of Vermont Burlington, VT David M. Burns, M.D. University of California, San Diego School of Medicine San Diego, CA
Chapter 3	The Case Against Hardening of the Target	David M. Burns, M.D. University of California, San Diego School of Medicine San Diego, CA
Chapter 4	Examining a Quarter-Century of Smoking Cessation Trials: Is the Target Becoming Harder to Treat?	Jennifer E. Irvin University of South Florida and the H. Lee Moffitt Cancer Center and Research Institute Tampa, FL Thomas H. Brandon, Ph.D. University of South Florida and the H. Lee Moffitt Cancer Center and Research Institute Tampa, FL
Chapter 5	Changes in Measures of Nicotine Dependence Using Cross-Sectional and Longitudinal Data from COMMIT	Andrew Hyland, Ph.D. Roswell Park Cancer Institute Buffalo, NY K. Michael Cummings, Ph.D., M.P.H. Roswell Park Cancer Institute Buffalo, NY

- Chapter 6** **Changes in Smoking Habits in the American Cancer Society CPS I During 12 Years of Follow-Up**
- Thomas G. Shanks, M.P.H.,
M.S.
Tobacco Control Policies
Project
University of California at
San Diego
San Diego, CA
- Christy M. Anderson, B.S.
Tobacco Control Policies
Project
University of California at
San Diego
San Diego, CA
- Chapter 7** **Changes in Number of Cigarettes Smoked per Day: Cross-Sectional and Birth Cohort Analyses Using NHIS**
- David M. Burns, M.D.
University of California,
San Diego School of
Medicine
San Diego, CA
- Jacqueline M. Major, M.S.
Tobacco Control Policies
Project
University of California at
San Diego
San Diego, CA
- Thomas G. Shanks, M.P.H.,
M.S.
Tobacco Control Policies
Project
University of California at
San Diego
San Diego, CA
- Chapter 8** **Changes in Cross-Sectional Measures of Cessation, Numbers of Cigarettes Smoked per Day, and Time to First Cigarette—California and National Data**
- David M. Burns, M.D.
University of California,
San Diego School of
Medicine
San Diego, CA

Jacqueline M. Major, M.S.
Tobacco Control Policies
Project
University of California at
San Diego
San Diego, CA

Christy M. Anderson, B.S.
Tobacco Control Policies
Project
University of California at
San Diego
San Diego, CA

Jerry W. Vaughn, B.S.
Tobacco Control Policies
Project
University of California at
San Diego
San Diego, CA

**Chapter 9 Hardening of the
Target: Evidence From
Massachusetts**

Carolyn C. Celebucki, Ph.D.
Massachusetts Department
of Public Health
Tobacco Control Program
Boston, MA
University of Rhode Island,
Department of Psychology
Kingston, RI

Phyllis Brawarsky, M.P.H.
Massachusetts Department
of Public Health
Bureau of Health Statistics,
Research and Evaluation
Boston, MA

Reviewers include:

Erik Augustson, Ph.D.
Cancer Prevention Fellow
Division of Cancer Prevention
National Cancer Institute
Bethesda, MD

Gary Giovino, Ph.D.
Department of Cancer Prevention,
Epidemiology and Biostatistics
Roswell Park Cancer Institute
Smoking Control Program
Buffalo, NY

Dorothy K. Hatsukami, Ph.D.
Professor
Department of Psychiatry
University of Minnesota
Minneapolis, MN

Jack Henningfield, Ph.D.
Vice President
Research and Health Policy
Pinney Associates, Inc.
Bethesda, MD

John Hughes, M.D.
University of Vermont
Human Behavioral Pharmacology
Laboratory
Burlington, VT

Lynn T. Kozlowski, Ph.D.
Department of Biobehavioral
Health
The Pennsylvania State University
University Park, PA

Linda L. Pederson, Ph.D.
Centers for Disease Control and
Prevention
Office on Smoking and Health
Atlanta, GA

John Slade
Professor of Medicine
University of Medicine and
Dentistry
Program in Addictions
New Brunswick, NJ

Kenneth Warner
School of Public Health
The University of Michigan
Department of Health Management
and Policy
Ann Arbor, MI

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	iii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>Contents</i>	xi
Introduction	1
Is the Target Hardening? Are Smokers Less Likely to Quit Now Than in the Past?	2
Are We Seeing a Hardening of the Population? Or a Hardening Of Our Interventions?	4
What Can We Learn From and About Special Populations? How Can Better Surveillance Help Us to Design Better Treatments and Dissemination Efforts?	5
Importance of Widening the Lens—Combining Clinical and Broader Policy-Based and Public Health Approaches and Building Consumer Demand	6
References	9
Chapter 1: Smokers Who Have Not Quit: Is Cessation More Difficult and Should We Change Our Strategies?	11
Introduction	11
Definition of the Question	12
Measures of Hardening	14
Have Cessation and Abstinence Rates Fallen Overall?	16
Have Recent Cessation Rates Fallen Among Populations That Have Achieved Low Smoking Prevalence?	17
Are Residual Smokers Heavier Smokers or More Addicted?	21
Do Current Smokers Have Higher Comorbidity Than Smokers Did in Previous Decades?	25
Are Residual Smokers Concentrated in Less Advantaged Demographic Groups and Those With Less Exposure To Tobacco Control Interventions?	26
Discussion and Summary	27
References	30
Chapter 2: The Case for Hardening of the Target	33
Introduction	33
Why It Is Important to Test the Hardening Hypothesis	35
An Adequate Test of the Hardening Hypothesis Is Needed	36
Dependence May Not Be the Most Relevant Cause of Any Hardening	37
Summary	38
References	38

Chapter 3: The Case Against Hardening of the Target	41
Introduction	41
Effect of Individual Factors on Heavy Smokers	42
Effect of Environmental Factors on Heavy Smokers	46
Summary	47
References	48
Chapter 4: Examining a Quarter-Century of Smoking Cessation Trials: Is the Target Becoming Harder to Treat?	49
Introduction	49
Method	51
Results	54
Discussion	55
References	59
Chapter 5: Changes in Measures of Nicotine Dependence Using Cross-Sectional and Longitudinal Data from COMMIT	61
Introduction	61
Methods	61
Analysis	64
Results	64
Summary	65
References	70
Chapter 6: Changes in Smoking Habits in the American Cancer Society CPS I During 12 Years of Follow-Up	71
Introduction	71
Cancer Prevention Study I	71
Methods of Analysis	72
Results	73
References	81
Chapter 7: Changes in Number of Cigarettes Smoked per Day: Cross-Sectional and Birth Cohort Analyses Using NHIS	83
Introduction	83
Methods	84
Results	86
Discussion	95
References	97

Chapter 8: Changes in Cross-Sectional Measures of Cessation, Numbers of Cigarettes Smoked per Day, and Time to First Cigarette—California and National Data101

 Introduction101

 Changes in National Cessation Rates and Number of Cigarettes Smoked per Day101

 Changes in Cessation Rates, Number of Cigarettes Smoked Per Day, and Time to First Cigarette in California, 1990 to 1999110

 Summary123

 References125

Chapter 9: Hardening of the Target: Evidence from Massachusetts127

 Background127

 Methods130

 Analysis132

 Results132

 Discussion141

 Limitations143

 References143